

MINUTES OF MEETING  
NEW JERSEY PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS COMMISSION  
September 24, 2015  
10:00 a.m.  
495 West State Street  
Trenton, New Jersey

The meeting was called to order by Chair P. Kelly Hatfield.

Present were:

Commissioners:

John Bonanni  
John Eskilson  
David Jones  
Paula Voos  
Richard Wall

Also present were:

Joseph Blaney, Deputy General Counsel  
Christine Lucarelli-Carneiro, Deputy General Counsel  
David N. Gambert, Deputy General Counsel  
Don Horowitz, Acting General Counsel  
Frank Kanther, Deputy General Counsel  
Kellie Hullfish, who acted as Stenographer

At the commencement of the meeting, Chair Hatfield, pursuant to Section 5 of the Open Public Meetings Act, entered this announcement into the minutes of the meeting:

Adequate notice has been provided by the dissemination of a written "Annual Notice of Meeting." On December 18, 2014 a copy of such notice was:

- (a) prominently posted in a public place at the offices of the Public Employment Relations Commission;
- (b) sent to the business offices of the Trenton Times and the Courier Post, as well as to the State House press row addresses of 25 media outlets;
- (c) copies e-mailed to the Secretary of State for filing; and
- (d) posted on the agency's web site.

Furthermore on September 17, 2015, copies of an additional written "Notice of Meeting" were posted and sent in a similar manner.

The first item on the agenda was the minutes of the August 13, 2015 regular Commission meeting. A motion to adopt the minutes was made by Commissioner Bonanni and seconded by Commissioner Voos. The motion to adopt the minutes was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Eskilson, Voos and Wall) and one opposed (Commissioner Jones).

The next item on the agenda was the minutes of the September 3, 2015 special Commission meeting. A motion to adopt the minutes was made by Commissioner Bonanni and seconded by Commissioner Voos. The motion to adopt the minutes was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Eskilson, Voos and Wall) and one opposed (Commissioner Jones).

The Chair reminded the Commissioners of PERC's upcoming Symposium on Friday, October 16, 2015. PERC is still awaiting approval for CLE credits from the Board of Continuing Legal Education.

The Counsel's Office distributed a monthly report.

The first case for consideration was the draft decision in City of Newark and Fraternal Order of Police, Newark Lodge No. 12, Docket No. CO-2014-205. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Bonanni seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of five

in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Eskilson, Voos and Wall) and one opposed (Commissioner Jones).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in Hoboken Board of Education and Hoboken Education Association, Docket No. SN-2015-026. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Voos seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni recused himself because a family member is the Superintendent of the Hoboken School District. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Eskilson, Jones, Voos and Wall).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in State of New Jersey and Council of New Jersey State College Locals, AFT, Docket No. SN-2015-031. Commissioner Jones moved the draft decision and Commissioner Voos seconded the motion. Commissioner Eskilson recused himself because the law firm Mets, Schiro & McGovern are counsel to Council of New Jersey State College Locals, AFT. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Jones, Voos and Wall).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in Paterson State-Operated School District and Paterson Education Association, Docket No. SN-2015-034. Commissioner Bonanni moved the draft decision and Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved

(Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Eskilson, Jones, Voos and Wall).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in Elizabeth Board of Education and Elizabeth Education Association, Docket No. SN-2015-035. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Bonanni seconded the motion. The draft decision resulted in a tie vote of three in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni and Eskilson), and three opposed (Commissioners Jones, Voos and Wall).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in Borough of Helmetta and Teamsters Local 210, Docket No. SN-2015-050. Commissioner Wall moved the draft decision and Commissioner Eskilson seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni recused himself because the law firm Cleary, Giacobbe, Alfieri & Jacobs law firm represents the Borough of Helmetta and he is recused from all cases that are represented by this law firm. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Eskilson, Voos and Wall) and one opposed (Commissioner Jones).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in City of Englewood and IBT Local 11, Docket No. SN-2015-053. Commissioner Bonanni moved the draft decision and Chair Hatfield seconded the motion. Commissioner Eskilson recused himself because the Kroll Firm represents IBT. Commissioner Wall recused

himself because the law firm Kroll Heineman Carton is legal counsel for PBA. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of three in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni and Voos) and one opposed (Commissioner Jones).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in Warren County Community College and Warren County College Faculty Association, Docket No. SN-2015-055. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Chair Hatfield seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was not approved with a vote of two in favor (Chair Hatfield and Commissioner Eskilson), and three opposed (Commissioners Jones, Voos and Wall).

The Commission was unable to reach a consensus on this matter at its meeting today. Therefore, it will be reconsidered by the Commission at a future meeting.

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in Hackensack Board of Education and Hackensack Education Association, Docket No. SN-2015-058. Commissioner Jones moved the draft decision and Commissioner Voos seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Eskilson, Jones, Voos and Wall).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in Elizabeth Board of Education and Elizabeth Education Association, Docket No. SN-2015-059. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Eskilson, Jones, Voos and Wall).

The next case for consideration was the draft decision in Hackensack Board of Education Association, Docket No. SN-2015-060. Commissioner Jones moved the draft decision and Commissioner Eskilson seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Eskilson, Jones, Voos and Wall).

The last case for consideration was the draft decision in Vineland Board of Education and Felicia Gonzalez and Barbara Dean, OAL Docket Nos. EDU-10085-13 & EDU-10092-13, Agency Docket Nos. 129/6/13 & 130/6/13 and PERC Docket Nos. TI-2013-004 & TI-2013-005. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Eskilson, Jones, Voos and Wall).

Commissioner Jones made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Commissioner Eskilson seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved. The meeting was then adjourned.

The next regular meeting is scheduled to be held on  
Thursday, October 29, 2015.